

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN
SOUTHERN DIVISION

JERRY WAGNER, as Guardian of LESLIE
CARLE STEWART, a legally incapacitated
person

Plaintiff,

v.

STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE
INSURANCE COMPANY, an Illinois
corporation

Defendant.

Case No. 10-11733

HONORABLE ARTHUR J. TARNOW
SENIOR UNITED STATES
DISTRICT JUDGE

HONORABLE PAUL J. KOMIVES

ORDER SUSTAINING PLAINTIFF'S OBJECTION [38]

Now before the Court is Plaintiff's Objection [38] to the Magistrate Judge's Order [35] granting in part and denying in part Defendant's Motion for Protective Order [16] regarding the protection of the ACE documents.

Plaintiff objects to protection of ACE documents in this particular case. Pl.s' Obj. [38], at 1. The ACE documents were revealed in open court during the *Armisted* trial. *See e.g., Armisted v. State Farm* (No. 2:07-10259). They have been public since that time.

The Court has reviewed the entire record and sees no basis for protection of the ACE documents. This very issue has been before the Court in many cases involving similar claims against Defendant. The Magistrate Judge's decision was clearly erroneous, as it conflicts with this Court's prior rulings and attempts to protect public documents.

Accordingly,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Objection [38] is **SUSTAINED**.

SO ORDERED.

Dated: August 29, 2011

s/Arthur J. Tarnow
ARTHUR J. TARNOW
SENIOR UNITED STATES DISTRICT
JUDGE

I hereby certify that the foregoing document was sent to parties of record on August 29, 2011 by electronic and/or ordinary mail.

s/Michael Williams
Relief Case Manager for the
Honorable Arthur J. Tarnow